

Stage 1 Briefing

Agriculture and Rural Communities (Scotland) Bill

March 2024



Stage 1 Briefing

Agriculture and Rural Communities (Scotland) Bill

March 2024



Introduction

The Law Society of Scotland is the professional body for over 13,000 Scottish solicitors.

We are a regulator that sets and enforces standards for the solicitor profession which helps people in need and supports business in Scotland, the UK and overseas. We support solicitors and drive change to ensure Scotland has a strong, successful and diverse legal profession. We represent our members and wider society when speaking out on human rights and the rule of law. We also seek to influence changes to legislation and the operation of our justice system as part of our work towards a fairer and more just society.

The Agriculture and Rural Communities (Scotland) Bill¹ (the **Bill**) was introduced by Mairi Gougeon, Cabinet Secretary for Rural Affairs, Land Reform and Islands on 28 September 2023. We submitted written evidence² to the Rural Affairs and Islands Committee of the Scottish Parliament as part of its Stage 1 consideration of the Bill in November 2023.

The Rural Affairs and Islands Committee's Stage 1 Report on the Bill (the **Stage 1 Report**)³ was published on 18 March 2024.

We welcome the opportunity to consider and provide comment on the Bill ahead of the Stage 1 debate scheduled for 27 March 2024.

General Remarks

The Bill operates as a framework, which will in turn be supplemented by more detailed secondary legislation.

We are cognisant of the potential benefits of this approach, for example, allowing greater flexibility in designing and implementing the underlying policy proposals, particularly should these evolve over time. We nonetheless highlight the need for flexibility to be appropriately balanced against ensuring there is clarity in the law, appropriate levels of parliamentary scrutiny underpinning legislative and policy developments, and meaningful stakeholder consultation.

We highlight the importance of there being certainty and clarity for those operating in the sector. Individuals and organisations must be able to guide their conduct based on clear and understandable legal standards. We would welcome greater detail as to the proposed measures and how they will operate in practice. Without this, it is difficult to fully understand and assess their likely impacts, particularly on those operating in the sector.

It is crucial to upholding the rule of law that the law is clear, comprehensible, and transparent so that requirements can be understood by those affected. We highlight that a framework made up

¹ [Agriculture and Rural Communities \(Scotland\) Bill](#)

² Accessible [here](#)

³ [Stage 1 Report](#)



of primary and significant volumes of secondary legislation can be challenging for those directly affected by the law to access and fully understand.

As detailed below, a number of the Bill's provisions require Scottish Ministers to “consult such persons as they consider appropriate” before making the relevant regulations. We particularly stress the importance of robust consultation on such secondary legislation, to provide an opportunity for scrutiny and critical comment from stakeholders on the details of the measures. We welcome the recommendations in the Stage 1 Report in relation to importance of stakeholder consultation in this context, for example at paragraph 56.

More generally, we note the ongoing and prospective legislative and policy reform within the wider agricultural and environmental legal landscape – covering areas such as land and estate management, land reform, and biodiversity matters. We highlight the importance of considering the interplay and overlap between such reforms to ensure a consistent and aligned approach across all policy developments affecting the rural sector.

Comments on Sections of the Bill

Part 1 (Objectives and Planning)

Part 1 sets out the key objectives of agricultural policy and imposes a duty on the Scottish Ministers to prepare and lay before the Scottish Parliament a 5 year Rural Support Plan setting out the strategic priorities of the Scottish Ministers for that period.

Sections 1-3

We have no specific comments on this section at this stage.

Part 2 (Support for agriculture, rural development and related matters)

Part 2 confers the power on the Scottish Ministers to provide support for the purposes set out in schedule 1 and makes a range of provisions in connection with the support framework.

Section 4

Section 4 is the basis for the Scottish Ministers to provide support for or in connection with the purposes that are set out in schedule 1.

We would generally note the importance of ensuring consistency across different areas of law – for example agricultural support, agricultural tenancies, planning, tax, biodiversity, and environmental – to ensure that the objectives in one area are not disrupted by technical obstacles in others.



We note that schedule 1 (which sets out the purposes of support referred to at section 4(1)), Part 4, at paragraph 15(2) refers to “Compensating persons in respect of additional costs incurred and income lost”. We consider that greater information around the policy intention would be welcomed, particularly given the related legal principles potentially engaged by the operation of a compensation scheme of this nature.

Sections 5-9

We have no specific comments on these sections at this stage.

Section 10

We note section 10 of the Bill and the provisions relating to the refusal or recovery of support in the “public interest”. This section creates a power to refuse to provide support or recover support given if Scottish Ministers consider that it is not in the public interest for a person to receive it. We would highlight the absence of a definition of “public interest” or an indication of due process before such financial sanctions occur. We consider that both of these aspects will require consideration in any resulting secondary legislation, particularly given the need for legal clarity and compliance with related legal obligations, including the European Convention on Human Rights.

We would also welcome greater detail and clarity on the types of scenarios where it is envisaged that such powers would be exercised. It is of particular importance in the context of funding and wider industry support that there is certainty for those operating in the agriculture sector, and sufficient time to enable them to plan and develop their business accordingly. It is important that those operating in the sector can have a clear understanding of legal requirements and related support so that they may guide their conduct accordingly.

Section 10(3) of the Bill places a requirement on Scottish Ministers to “consult such persons as they consider appropriate” before making regulations under the section. In the interests of transparency, we consider that there would be merit in the outcomes of such consultations being published. This would similarly apply to the equivalent consultation requirements elsewhere in the Bill, such as at sections 9(2), 13(3), and 26(6).

More generally, greater detail on who is intended to be consulted would be welcomed and we would highlight the importance of undertaking a robust consultation process to capture the views of interested parties.

Sections 11-12

We have no specific comments on these sections at this stage.

Section 13

We note that Section 13(4)(a) provides that regulations made under section 13 are subject to the affirmative procedure if they “in the opinion of the Scottish Ministers, would make significant provision” (and otherwise would be subject to the negative procedure). Section 13(5) sets out what “significant provision” includes for these purposes. This is referred to in the Delegated Powers Memorandum as an ‘either way’ power (paragraph 68). We note the subjective nature of this assessment and consider that greater clarity would be welcomed within the Bill as to the

parliamentary procedure used for regulations made pursuant to section 13. Such an assessment may benefit from additional procedural safeguards to ensure that the appropriate procedure is used.

Sections 14-15

We have no specific comments on these sections at this stage.

Section 16

Similar to our comments above in relation to section 10, section 16 allows for provision in relation to the withholding (section 16(2)(g)) and recovery (section 16(2)(f)) of support. Likewise these provisions lack specification and would merit similar consideration as above should subsequent regulations be introduced.

We welcome the use of the affirmative procedure when criminal offences are being created through secondary legislation (section 13(5)(iv); section 16). We note, however, that regulations relating to the other provisions of section 16 may also merit the use of the affirmative procedure, whether or not they create an offence pursuant to section 16(1)(e).

Sections 17-18

We have no specific comments on these sections at this stage.

Part 3 (Powers to modify existing legislation relating to support)

Part 3 makes provision enabling the Scottish Ministers to amend and adjust the enactments which contain the CAP rules.

We would highlight as a general observation the increasing legislative complexity in this area. We note that legislative powers in relation to retained EU Law are contained in myriad primary and secondary legislation, guidance, and legal authorities – including the general EU withdrawal and continuity legislation, retained EU law, subsequent sectoral legislation, in addition to pre-existing legislative authority.

We have no specific comments on sections 19-25 at this stage.

Part 4 (Miscellaneous)

Part 4 contains a variety of measures relating to agriculture, including a power for the Scottish Ministers to impose continuous professional development (CPD) requirements, and the identification of animals.

We have no specific comments on sections 26-29 at this stage.



Part 5 (Final Provisions)

Part 5 contains general provisions that apply to the whole Bill, including interpretative provisions and commencement.

We have no specific comments on sections 30-34 at this stage.

Schedule 1

Please see our comments above in relation to section 4.

Schedule 2

We have no specific comments on schedule 2 at this stage.



For further information, please contact:

Policy Team
Law Society of Scotland
0131 476 816
policy@lawscot.org.uk